TRANSFORMING ORGANISATIONS WITH THE ARTS.

Research Report

TILLTEUROPE
PROJECT 2009
The Research Framework Strategy is produced within the work of the policy grouping TILLT Europe supported by the Culture Program strand 2 at the European Union. This group has committed itself to producing a package of studies to understand the impact of artistic interventions in business and in research projects, and to formulate recommendations on European policies that should support this type of intervention. The TILLT Europe project management group consists of members from TILLT (Sweden), DISONANCIAS (Spain) and the WZB – Social Science Research Center Berlin (Germany).
Abstract and Conclusions of Report
A Research Framework for Evaluating the Effects of Artistic Interventions in Organizations

By Ariane Berthoin Antal, WZB

Abstract
The past decades have witnessed the emergence of a multitude of ways to stimulate innovation and organizational learning in response to changes in society and economic pressures. Among these are “artistic interventions” - when some form of art is brought into an organization for several hours, days, or months, to trigger or support a learning and change process at the individual, group, or organizational level. The underlying assumption of practitioners is that bringing people, processes, and products from the “foreign culture” of the arts into the workplace helps to stimulate new ways of thinking and acting by irritating routines, challenging established mindsets, and developing new skills. Artistic interventions in organizations are conducted with high expectations of a multitude of positive outcomes. Research has not kept pace with these developments in practice. Very few empirical studies have been conducted to establish whether the high hopes placed on these interventions are justified.

This report presents a research framework designed to start closing the gap between research and practice by enabling an analysis of the values that artistic interventions add in organizations. It is based on our past research, on existing literature, and on a series of three “Artful Research” workshops conducted in Berlin in September 2009, at which thirty three artists, people from companies and from intermediary organizations, consultants, and researchers shared their knowledge about the effects they have observed in connection with artistic interventions in organizations. The report answers two questions: 1) Where should attention be directed to find the kinds of value that artistic interventions add in organizations? 2) And how should the research be conducted?

1) Our analysis indicates that stakeholders with experience in this area see value in giving people opportunities to experiment, develop new kinds of knowledge in new ways, nurture hidden skills, and discover an interest in cultural issues. The value that individuals draw out of an artistic intervention can flow out and generate value a) in their work, b) in interactions with others in their unit or across organizational units, and c) beyond that to affect organizational strategy, performance and culture. The flow outwards is not automatic, however, and research is needed to clarify the conditions that support it.

2) We propose a research framework composed of a mix of methods to adequately capture the richness and complexity of artistic interventions, with action research at the heart, flanked by case studies and survey research. The first challenge to tackle is the development of a theoretically sound understanding of how the effects of artistic interventions flow in organizations, as a basis for specifying indicators that do justice to the subtle and complex ways stakeholders perceive effects in the organization. The proposed research strategy supports individual and organizational learning during the project, and generates knowledge that can be shared with others (e.g., in the policy-making and academic communities) afterwards. The participatory research approach also offers the stakeholders an opportunity to develop a variety of valuable skills.
Next steps are the refinement and piloting of the research framework in different kinds of organizations in various European countries.

Conclusions
Like most innovations, the phenomenon of artistic interventions in organizations has met with enthusiasm, growing curiosity, and, naturally, some scepticism. The claims about the positive potential contributions to learning and change in organizations that are attached to them are enthusiastically shared by many people who have participated in some kind of artistic intervention. Policymakers and decision-makers who have not yet experienced such interventions but who sense that new approaches are needed to stimulate innovativeness in all sectors of the economy are expressing curiosity: What effects do artistic interventions really have in organizations? Too little empirical research had been conducted to be able to respond to this question, which is not surprising in a relatively new field of practice. Researchers are professional sceptics, so their engagement in closing the gap between claims and reality in this field is sorely needed. The curiosity of policymakers in the European Commission therefore triggered this study, which has addressed a twofold question: Where should attention be directed to find the kinds of value that artistic interventions add in organizations? And how should the research be conducted?

In order to respond to this double question and generate a research framework to guide future studies, we first reviewed the literature, then sought out the expertise of stakeholders in the field. Although the literature about artistic interventions is expanding, we found that very few publications report about studies on the effects of artistic interventions in organizations (see chapter 2 of final report). The series of three Artful Research workshops that we organized in Berlin in September 2009 was designed to tap into the experience of artists, intermediary organizations, people from organizations that had engaged in artistic interventions, consultants who have worked with artists, and researchers who have studied arts and business, innovation and change, or who have methodological expertise (see list of participants below). The experimental format of the Artful Research workshops stimulated the participants to explore what they have seen happen in organizations during and after long term (several months) and short term (several hours or days) artistic interventions. We created the opportunity for them to delve into and share also into their (often tacit) knowledge about direct and indirect effects (see chapter 3 of final report).

Where to look for value
The preliminary analysis of the rich material produced during the Artful Research workshops permitted us to identify areas in which to look for effects that the stakeholders consider valuable.

- A key finding is that the stakeholders value the growth they see in people in and of itself, not simply as means to an end. For some stakeholders this human growth was at least part of the original intention of the intervention, for others it was a discovery during the intervention that gave them the feeling the project was worth the effort. They see value in giving people opportunities to experiment, develop new kinds of knowledge in new ways, nurture hidden skills, and discover an interest in cultural issues. The
growth in self-esteem that stakeholders observed during and after an intervention is evidently intensely satisfying.

- The reports from experience indicate that the value that individuals draw out of an artistic intervention can flow out and generate value a) in their work, b) in interactions with others in their unit or across organizational units, and c) beyond that to affect organizational strategy, performance and culture. Figure 1 illustrates the different kinds of value that stakeholders have observed emerging in each of these areas.

- Since individuals (at all levels and in all departments) are the agents of organizational learning, the addition of value must start with them, but the movement of value from the core outwards to the meet the strategic interests of the organization is not automatic. Therefore, research seeking to document the value that artistic interventions can add in organizations will also need to explore the conditions that enable or impede the ability of individuals and the organization to generate value from the experience.

Figure 1: Where to look for the values artistic interventions can add

How to look for value
The proposed research framework takes into consideration the fact there is as yet no theory capable of explaining the complex phenomenon of artistic interventions and often indirect ways that they affect organizations.

- The implication is that researchers-evaluators have to develop an innovative and customized “toolkit” with appropriate indicators for studying these interventions in the very process of conducting their research.
Furthermore, the proposed framework recognizes that the stakeholders in any given project have different roles and interests, as well as different expectations of and perspectives on the organization, the artistic intervention, and research. Gaining an understanding of how artistic interventions generate value in organizations depends to a large extent on the willingness of the diverse stakeholders to share their knowledge and experience.

- The implication of this fact is that researchers must surrender their usual primacy in the research process if they want to understand the phenomenon. A participative research methodology is needed in which the various stakeholders contribute to defining a question or set of questions they agree is worth pursuing, then to collecting and making sense of the data, and to representing the results.

We therefore propose a research framework composed of a mix of methods to adequately capture the richness and complexity of artistic interventions, with action research at the heart, flanked by case studies and survey research.

- The form of action research we recommend is action evaluation research, which supports individual and organizational learning during the project, and generates knowledge that can be shared with others (e.g., in the policy-making and academic communities) afterwards. As discussed in chapter 4 of the final report, participating in action evaluation research also offers the stakeholders an opportunity to develop a variety of valuable skills (e.g., intercultural competence, reflective transfer and conflict engagement).

- In addition, we see a need for researchers to conduct case studies to derive and test action strategies, trace causal pathways, and explore hypotheses that are generated by action evaluation research on specific interventions. The accumulation of findings from action research and multiple case studies will provide a solid basis for formulating conclusions, and also for developing survey instruments.

- Surveys will be a useful complement to the qualitative research methods. Some participants at the Artful Research workshops were reluctant to embark on surveys at this early stage of understanding in the field. Until appropriate instruments have been developed, we therefore recommend starting by analyzing the results of ongoing surveys in organizations (e.g., employee surveys) to see whether they reveal effects that could be related to artistic interventions.

**Next steps**

The Artful Research workshops showed how valuable it is to engage with stakeholders early in the research process to define the focus and formulate a framework. The proposed research framework is ready to be refined and piloted in different settings (see figure 2). The time is evidently ripe for the enthusiasts of artistic interventions to engage in serious, (self-)critical research into the effects of their projects. The results of these studies could whet the appetite for experimentation of those observers who are curious, and they might also shift some of the sceptics into the camp of the curious.
Engaging in artistic interventions is by nature an unpredictable process. Using the mix of research methods proposed here will help stakeholders clarify which kinds of value are likely to emerge under which conditions. It will provide guidance in how to create supportive conditions to benefit from artistic interventions in organizations. Equally importantly, systematic research will help specify when not to take the risk, so that stakeholders do not embark naively into such interventions. But research results cannot replace the courage needed for decision and action, both at the policy making level and within organizations. Experience suggests that one of the preconditions for creating value through artistic interventions is and will remain the courage to trust: to trust the process and the people involved in it. Next steps therefore include the willingness take a step into the unknown—to learn by engaging in and reflecting on experiments.
Participants

“Artful Research: Assessing the Effects of Artistic Interventions”

September 23, 24 and 25, 2009

Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung
Reichpietschufer 50, D-10785 Berlin

Facilitated by
Ariane Berthoin Antal & Daniella Arieli

Kenneth Agerholm, musician, Denmark
Victoria Alarik, actress, Teater Spira, Sweden
Johanna Almer, Chalmers University of Technology, Sweden
Pia Areblad, CEO TILLT, Sweden
Daniela Arieli, Emek-Yezreel Academic College, Israel
Teresa Badia, Coordinator Disonancias Catalunya, Spain
Nina Baur, Technical University Berlin, Germany
Ariane Berthoin Antal, program leader “Artistic Interventions in Organizations”, WZB, Germany
Gabriel Blom, Paroc AB, Sweden
Clément Dirié, publisher and art critic, France
Nema el-Nahas, Arts Council England South West, UK
Michael Eriksson, Chalmers University of Technology, Sweden
Julien Eymeri, director, Eurogroup, France
Hazel Grain, filmmaker, UK
Ernst Handl, artist and director, Handl-e.pictures, Germany
Irene Hediger, Zurich University of the Arts, Switzerland
Gerda Hempel, director, Artlab, Denmark
Kirsten Hense, Handl-e.pictures, Germany
Michael Hutter, director, research unit “Cultural Sources of Newness”, WZB, Germany
Borja Izaola, architect, Labein Tecnalia, Spain
Camilla Krebsbach-Gnath, KGD Consulting, Germany
Lars Lindström, HR manager, Paroc AB, Sweden
Josep-Maria Martin, artist, Spain
Maria Mebius Schröder, actress, TILLT, Sweden
Anna Ostrowski, TILLT, Sweden
Claus Noppeney, Berw University of the Arts, Switzerland
Jörg Reckenhich, artist and consultant, nextmove, Germany
Clare Reddington, iShed and The Pervasive Media Studio, UK
Henrik Schrat, artist, Germany, and doctoral candidate University of Essex, UK
Howell Schroeder, Schroeder-Forbes, and associate, Ashridge Management College, UK
Anke Strauß, doctoral candidate, University of Essex, UK
Miren Vives Almadoz, Disonancias, Spain
Solveig Weller, research fellow, WZB, Germany